# What is the Role of the <br> "Culture War" in American <br> Electoral Politics - Is it a Myth? Reality? Both? 

MU MVZ 449<br>Spring 2010<br>Dave McCuan<br>Masaryk University

Red vs. Blue America 2004


## "The 49\% Nation" - Michael Barone




## Is America Deeply Divided?

- "You've got $80 \%$ to $90 \%$ of the country that look at each other like they are on separate planets" Matthew Dowd, 2004 Bush reelection strategist; \& Schwarzenegger strategist
- "The red states get redder, the blue states get bluer, and the political map of the US takes on the coloration of the Civil War" E.J. Dionne Jr., Washington Post


## Party Activists More Polarized

|  | De le gate D ifference | ID diffrence |
| :--- | ---: | ---: |
| Sovermmentsmouncomoreto |  | 72 |
| solve national problems | 67 | 13 |
| Cut taxes to improve economy | 62 | 35 |
| Abortion available |  | 32 |
| Anti-terroism laws restrictcivil | 62 |  |
| liberties | 72 | 28 |
| Important to workw/UN | 35 |  |

Difference between party activists and normal GOP and DEM
NYT/CBS Poll 2004

## Prevalence of Activists




## Red vs. Blue America 2004



## No Swing Voters

- 7 of Top 8 Kerry State have GOP governors
- 9 states that Bush carries by $10 \%+$ have Democratic governors
- Are swing voters truly "independents" or are these subsets "weak partisans" leaning one way or the other?


## Red vs. Blue America 2004



## Latest vote, county ly county

Vice President Gore won in 676 counties and Texas Gov. George W. Bush
in 2,436 counties, according to preliminary results.


Note: County election data was not reported for Alaska. Counties in blue, indicating vote for Gore, include Indian reservations in Montana, New Mexico and South Dakota.
Source: The Associated Press, ESRI Inc, USA TODAY analysis by Paul Overberg.

## U.S. Counties With Over 55\% Votes For Bush And Kerry In 2004 Election



Percentage of Votes

## Evidence of Deep Divide?

- Red and Blue States should have big differences on
- policy preferences
- Ideological positions
- Views on abortion
- Views on homosexuality


## Red vs. Blue America 2004



## Barone/Rove Hypothesis

- Two Americas
- "observant, tradition minded, moralistic... repelled by Bill Clinton"
- "unobservant, liberation-minded, relativist" pleased with Bill Clinton"


## Evidence of Deep Divide?

- Red and Blue States should have big differences on
- policy preferences
- Ideological positions
- Views on abortion
- Views on homosexuality

|  | Prayeris an important part of my <br> Inever doubt the exiatence of bed |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |

Red Versus Blue States: Political Inclinations


\% Agreeing 2000 ANES data

FIGURE 2.2
Both Red and Blue State Residents Are Basically Centrists



## LCSCALE7

Cases weighted by WEIGHT

FIGURE 2.3
Red and Blue State Residents Agree That the Parties Are Not Centrist



## Abortion Polarization



## Abortion Cleavages / Cross-Cutting Pressures

- Gender Gap
- North-South Divisions
- Deep divides?
- Religious \& social connotations / divisions
- Regional variations
- Age and gender variations


## Further Abortion Polarization



## Pew Foundation, The 2004 Political Landscape

| Divides on Abortion |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Stricter laws against abortion |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | $\begin{gathered} 1987 \\ \text { Fay Opp } \end{gathered}$ |  | 1993 |  | 2003 |  |
|  |  |  |  | Opp |  |  |
|  | $\%$ | $\%$ | \% | \% | $\%$ | $\%$ |
| Total | 41 | 51 | 32 | 60 | 36 | 57 |
| Men | 38 | 53 | 28 | 64 | 35 | 57 |
| Women | 44 | 50 | 34 | 58 | 36 | 58 |
| White Evangelical | 62 | 32 | 52 | 42 | 58 | 36 |
| White Mainline | 33 | 60 | 23 | 69 | 25 | 65 |
| White Catholic | 46 | 48 | 29 | 59 | 37 | 56 |
| Black Protestant | 35 | 54 | 29 | 63 | 32 | 63 |
| Secular | 15 | 72 | 16 | 81 | 18 | 78 |
| Republican | 48 | 46 | 45 | 48 | 50 | 44 |
| Democrat | 40 | 52 | 28 | 64 | 25 | 70 |
| Independent | 38 | 55 |  | 69 | 32 | 61 |

## FIGURE 4.1 <br> A Clear Majority of Americans Now Support Roe v. Wade



FIGURE 4.10
When Should Abortion Be Legal? Men and Women Are Not Very Different



- Please tell me whether or not you think it should be possible for a pregnant woman to obtain a legal abortion if:

1. the woman's health is serious endangered
2. she became pregnant as a result of rape
3. there is a strong change of serious defect in the baby
4. the family has low income and cannot afford any more children
5. she is not married and does not want to marry the man
6. she is married and does not want any more children

## Big differences between Red and Blue States on Abortion?

FIGURE 4.3
Regions Differ Less on Abortion than Commonly Thought


FIGURE 4.6
Partisans in the General Public Do Not Differ Much on Abortion


## Big differences between Rs and Ds on Abortion?

FIGURE 4.6
Partisans in the General Public Do Not Differ Much on Abortion


## Same Sex Marriage and Voting Behavior

Policy Toward Same Sex Couples
Bush\% Kerry\%

- Legally Marry ( $25 \%$ )
- Civil Unions (35\%)

22

- No Legal Recognition (37\%)
- Civil Unions (35\%) 5277

70 29

Source: 2004 National Exit Poll

FIGURE 5.4
Support for Equal Rights of Homosexuals in Employment Has Steadily Increased


FIGURE 5.6
Young Americans Are More Accepting of Legal Homosexual Relations


Democratic and Republican Views on Legal Homosexuality Differ but Not Hugely


Pew Foundation, 2004 Political Landscape:
Have electoral cleavages shifted?





FIGURE 7.3
Candidate Competition in Two Dimensions


Democrats and Republicans Separate on the Moral Dimension


## Are Differences Here a "Ditch and Not a Chasm"

- \# of Circumstances in which abortion should be legal
- CA 4.3
- Deep South 3.4
- Feeling thermometer on Gays (0-100)
- Blue state- 51
- Red state 43
- But, Real Secular- Church differences are consistent


## Fiorina's Explanation

- Parties change - The Rise of Purists
- Expansion of government
- Opening of political processes
- Politics is dominated by purists who care about policy/ideology, not just winning.


## A Causal Critique

## - Timing

- When do Fiorina's changes take place
- When does religious differential start?

FIGURE 6.2
Difference in Democratic Presidential Vote Between
Regular Churchgoers and Non-Attenders



## An Anti-Pluralist Critique

- Who participates?
- What do interest groups have to do to form?
- Hyperpluralism?


## Normative Critique

- Is there anything wrong with a "choice not an echo"?
- Is our democracy better or worse


## Alternative Explanations





