Bottom-up approaches

Mikro přístupy Přístupy zaměřené na člověka



- Neoliberalism and other mainstream strategies – great impact on development until 80s
- Their shortcomings generated alternative strategies
- Analysis of the key elements of the alternatives strategies - chance to overcome mainstream failings



 Examining the refocusing of alternative approaches away from simple economic growt toward broader consideration of equitable development and meeting human needs.





gies used in development discourse. Development is commonly defined, in its most elementary form, as a process of change mediated by some form of human intervention. The way in which this view has been put into practice is deeply rooted in a myth, more precisely in the Judaeo-Christian or Western myth of civilization and progress (Chapter 1). The moment





or Western myth of civilization and progress (Chapter 1). The moment one sector of reality, or of the truth, starts projecting itself as the whole reality, or the whole truth, categories of 'what is'/ what it is not' (negativisms) and even of superior/inferior (as implied in the underdevelopment/ development mode of thinking), start to proliferate. It is characteristic of an ideology, a race or religion which considers itself superior to define 'the



other' in reference to itself and in terms of what the other is not. Western civilization has brought about a massive process of acculturation of nonwhite peoples to the West and Western values, with only a few examples of inculturation (for example, modern Japan and Korea) to counterbalance and relieve this increasingly uniform and therefore impoverished landscape. The roots of this interventionist myth run very deep. Chapter 3 specifically questions the notion that development is essentially an interventionist project orchestrated from the outside, whether by governmental or non-governmental organizations (NGOs). Chapter 4 then challenges



Conceptualization of autonomy

impossible autarky. Autonomy conceptualizes what Thomas Sankara has defined as 'the right to invent one's own future'. Autonomous human agency rests on the four pillars which also form the core (Part II) of this book: autonomy in the political sphere (ownership and control) (Chapter 5); autonomy in the cultural sphere (literacy and the media) (Chapter 6); autonomy in the organizational sphere (management literacy) (Chapter 7); and in the economic sphere (self-reliance) (Chapter 8). Contemporary





interventionism

for almost half a century. Interventionism bases its (self-appointed) missions of modernization, extension, innovation, management, technology transfer and aid on ethnocentric perceptions of what is wrong (with 'them') and what is right (with 'us'). What makes the interventionist project possible is, beyond any doubt, the power of money. The deeper moral questions on which this right to intervene is based have remained unanswered (Chapter



intervencionismus

- Self-appointed mission
- Modernizace, inovace, management, přenosu technologií a rozvojové pomoci
- Založení na etnocentrické představě co je s nimi špatné a v čem my máme pravdu
- Hlubší morální otázka, na čem je tento intervencionistický přístup založen.



organizations, organizations of the rural poor, women's and other networks, rooted in autonomous human agency, are significant in that they challenge the entrenched principle of outside interventionism. The old colonialist civilizing mission substituted itself - uninvited and unsolicited - for the black man's burden. Shiva calls twentieth-century developmentalism 'the new colonialism': its moral, educational and cultural credentials are no less suspect than those of the older version. If --- of marality and our shared



numany, it ought – education understood as a mutually respectful, educational imperative – education understood as a mutually respectful, dialogical, transformative and (re)creative process, education 'as' development as opposed to education 'for' development (Chapter 4) – is intimately linked to the imperative of cultural embeddedness (Chapters 6, 7 and 8). These pages leave little doubt that interventionism is an educationally, culturally and ethically contaminated concept. Colonialism imposes its









A new religion without atheists

For decades a newfangled creed and moral imperative, development, has cast its shadow over the landscape of international relations. Development can justifiably be called the surrogate religion of the second half of the twentieth century. One of the more revealing findings of contemporary anthropology is that all societies and civilizations, whatever their nature – and this includes Western civilization – are underpinned by beliefs and myths. Myths are the products of a long evolution in humanity's creative





Buddhism⁶ and development

For economists see development in terms of increasing currency and things, thus fostering greed (*lôba*). Politicians see development in terms of increased power, thus fostering ill-will (*dôsha*). Both then work together, hand in glove, and measure the results in terms of quantity, thus fostering ignorance (*môha*) and completing the Buddhist triad of evils.

Sivaraksa, 1980: 6





Non-Western cultures are based on the idea of the godhead as immanent; their traditions and history are embedded in oracy⁷ and are therefore in a constant state of flux. In stark contrast, the Western God is transcendent, monotheistic, distant, a literally supernatural God.⁸ The West's religion can be characterized as 'the religion of the book', with a transcendent truth that is frozen, on record, safe, fixed and immune to human tampering. It seems not to matter that the book itself originated in



human tampering. It seems not to matter that the book itself originated in the living and imaginative oral traditions of a small, pastoral, seminomadic group of people, whose terms of reference, vocabulary and precepts now hardly fit a drastically changed urban-industrial context.





Science in crisis: a 'new heresy'

By the beginning of this decade, [1980s] ... a 'new heresy' was heard in the land. The 'scientific heresy' had amounted to a widening group of people observing that reality is not the way the religious authorities had been telling it. The 'new heresy' opined that reality is not the way the secular authorities had been describing it *either!* Empirical science was *not* the route to ultimate truth; and its technological accomplishments did not automatically lead to good effects.

Harman, 1988: 13



- Central focus of the post war strategies economic growth the the top-down definition of development
- Trickle down effect
- Growht is treated as a function of investment - simple formula that links appropriate levels of investment wiht incremental capital/output ration adn desired growth rates.



- Diffusion of technology allow the benefits of modernization to trickle down to the neediest sector of society.
- Development is veiwed as top-down approach in which important decision making is controlled by major international institutions in cooperation with local elites



Role of experts

- Typically international experts have conceived and designed development form the outside.
- The people to whom these projects are supposedly directed exist mainly in the abstract as socioeconomic indicators.



'popular participation'

 Is normally restricted to some hastily organized meeting on which outside experts ´brief´ local people about the objectives and achievements of the project.



Change in the agenda

- By the 60s obvious that economic growth - not necessarily correlated with improvement in other indicators
- Brazil, Iran, Maxico, Venzuela growth but maldevelopment









Who are 'the people'?

Speak about 'the people' and it is the minorities and the oppressed - those sections of the world population who have no economic or social status in society if judged by the standards of the dominant structures - who come most readily to mind. Oppression, however, takes many forms and operates at various levels. It is not possible, therefore, to speak in general terms of the amorphous masses of 'the oppressed', in the same way as it is not possible to classify all women indiscriminately under the heading of 'gender' or 'gender oppression' (Chapter 9). Even uncritical references to



Degrees of discrimination?

"To be a woman mayor in Brazil is very difficult – To be a woman mayor in São Paulo is even more difficult, particularly if this woman is from the North East region of Brazil.' That is, she is first discriminated against in her condition as woman, and second in her position as woman of the North East. She then added: 'My difficulty as a woman mayor would be correspondingly worse if I were black and a peasant.'





By the end of the 1960s, many analysts began to notice that economic growth was not necessarily correlated with other development objectives, such as rapid employment creation, the reduction of poverty and inequalities, and the provision of basic needs. Even in some countries (e.g., Brazil, Iran, Kenya, Mexico, Nicaragua, Pakistan, South Africa) in which rapid economic growth had been attained, severe 'maldevelopment' problems were appearing. Growth was not eradicating poverty or providing jobs at the speed anticipated and, in many cases, income inequalities were increasing. By 1970, some 944 million people, or 52 percent of the total population





Maldevelopment^s

The global process involving all countries in which some are suffering from lack of resources while others are wasting them.

Galtung, 1980: 14

A pattern of growth and resource use geared to private profit and power, and a pattern of dominance of the planet by the North which is no longer tenable.

Nerfin, 1987: 171





The Third World: a political concept

From my experiences living in the United States, I discovered the presence of the Third World in the First World such as the ghettos in the United States.... Discovering the Third World in the First, I also became aware of the presence of the First World in the Third World.... Third World is basically a political concept. The so-called 'First World' has within it its own Third World: the Third World has its First World represented by its ideology of domination, of power of the ruling classes. The Third World is, in the last analysis, the world of silence, of oppression, of dependence, of exploitation, of violence exercised by the ruling classes on the oppressed.

Freire, 1983: 35





Another Development

Answers the key questions: Development of *what*, development *by whom*, development *for whom*, development *how*, and contains the following key elements:

1 *Need-oriented*: that is, geared to human needs, both material and non-material, starting with the needs of the majority of the world's inhabitants, the dominated and the exploited. Ensuring the humanization of all human beings by the satisfaction of their needs for expression, creativity, equality and conviviality, and to understand and master their own destiny.





2 Endogenous: that is, stemming from the heart of each society, which defines in sovereignty its values and its vision of the future.

3 *Self-reliant*: that is, implying that each society relies primarily on its own strength and resources in terms of its members' energies and its natural and cultural environment,





4 *Ecologically sound*: that is, utilizing rationally the resources of the biosphere in full awareness of the potential of local ecosystems as well as the global and local outer limits imposed on present and future generations.

5 Based on *structural transformations*: they are required, more often than not, in social relations, in economic activities and in their spatial distribution, as well as in the power structure, so as to realize the conditions of self-management and participation in decision making by all those affected by it.

These five key elements are organically linked.

Nerfin, 1975: 10 (abridged)





'Third World': a terminology

Tiers Mondisme (Third Worldism), the somewhat romantic idea that the formerly colonized peoples would lead the world towards a more just social(-ist) order, has become redundant in the 1990s. The world's bad conscience about the situation has been replaced by a good dose of hypocrisy and cynicism. Coined in the 1950s by the demographer and economist Alfred Sauvy (1952),1 the term ought never to have been used in the first place, if only because it always had a 'third-rate' and condescending ring to it. The expression is also said to be epistemologically and politically incorrect: in view of the great diversity of cultures and traditions covered by its scope, we had better talk about Third Worlds (Verhelst, 1989: 4;



mequalities were increasing. By 1970, some 944 million people, or 52 percent of the total population of the South, were still living in absolute poverty (United Nations 1989; table 24, p. 39),¹ despite the development efforts of the previous decades. Moreover, evidence was accumulating of growing labor underemployment, especially in agriculture (e.g., Turnham 1971), and rising inequalities in income distribution (Adelman and Morris 1973; Fishlow 1972; Griffin 1969; Griffin and Khan 1972). Indeed, by the early 1970s, it had become 'a commonplace to argue that throughout much of the Third World growth was accompanied by increased inequality' (Griffin 1989: 165).



• The debates were on the sectoral allocation of investment, such as between agriculture and manufacturing industry, choice of technology, and import substitution versus export promotion. The question of how the benefits of growth in national income were shared by different socioeconomic groups in the society was infrequently raised. One reason for this neglect was, of course, the belief that even the poorest will benefit from growth, more so since institutional changes that were promoted at the same time, such as some land reform and an increasing role of the public sector, were supposed to facilitate this.



 The declaration of principles and program of action adopted by the Tripartite World Conference on Employment organized by the ILO proposed that strategies and national development plans and policies should include explicitly, as a priority objective, the promotion of employment and the satisfaction of basic needs of each country's population.



 It further specified that basic needs should be understood to include certain minimum requirements of a family for private consumption, such as adequate food, shelter, and clothing as well as certain household equipment and furniture, as well as certain essential services, such as safe drinking water, sanitation, public transport, and health, educational and cultural facilities (16).




development. Mahbab ul Haq (1976: 24-5), a Pakistani economist and World Bank official, remarked:

In country after country, economic growth is being accompanied by rising disparities ... the masses are complaining that development has not touched their ordinary lives. Very often, economic growth has meant very little social justice. It has been accompanied by rising unemployment, worsening social services, and increasing absolute and relative poverty.



•

Publication Information: Third World Development: A Basic Needs Approach. Contributors: Pradip K. Ghosh - editor. Publisher: Greenwood Press. Place of Publication: Westport, CT. Publication Year: 1984. Page Number: 4.



The basic-needs approach

• The basic-needs approach is seen as a more direct attack on poverty than those approaches that rely largely on raising incomes and productivities of the poor. Particular emphasis is given to improvements in health, nutrition and basic education, especially through improved and redirected public services, such as rural water supplies, sanitation facilities, primary schools, etc



 Some proponents of basic needs argue that the direct provision of essential goods and services will be a more efficient and more rapid way of eliminating poverty. While supporting efforts to raise productivity and income, it emphasizes that these alone may not be sufficient or efficient since: (1) consumers are not sufficiently knowledgeable about health and nutrition, and will therefore not spend incremental incomes wisely or efficiently;



 (2) there is known to be a serious maldistribution of incomes within households which can be overcome only through a more direct provision of goods and services; (3) some basic needs can only be met efficiently through public services, such as water supplies and sanitation; and (4) it is difficult to find policies, investment, etc. that will increase the productivity of all of the poor in a uniform way; very often the benefits of these innovations reach only a few.



 To the degree that basic needs improve the health and education level of the labour force, one can visualize an improvement in basic productivity. Better health facilities are likely to lower infant mortality rates, and ultimately affect fertility and the net reproduction rate. 2



 While it is conceded that basic human needs are partly conventional, and hence will vary among countries (or cultures), it is nevertheless argued that there are certain minimum levels of personal consumption and access to public services that can be regarded as everywhere essential to a decent standard of living, and in these cases it is possible to define targets in physical units on a global basis.



 For example, minimum targets for food and housing requirements can be defined quantitatively with reference to daily intake of calories and square metres of dwelling space per person. Qualitatively they can be defined in terms of the proportion of protein in food intake and household facilities such as toilets, piped water, electricity and basic furniture



- Thus, the basic-needs approach enables targets to be stated as physical rations of specific goods and services, having universal validity, instead of the abstract monetary aggregates making up gross national product (GNP) estimates. It emphasizes the necessaries of life in place of the values of the market place. $\underline{3}$
- This volume examines the experience of a substantial number of the third world countries in implementing development plans during approximately the 1970's and draws some general conclusions for policy action during the years ahead.



As the United Nations First Development Decade (1961–71) gave way to the second, a growing number of theorists and practitioners of development concluded that the focus of development on macroeconomic growth had been misplaced. Rather, they argued, the focus should be on the 'animate' instead of the 'inanimate' – on human resources, as measured by quality-oflife considerations, rather than on material resources, as measured by GNP figures (Black 1991: 20–1). Successful development should be measured not



IIIC CONSIGCIATIONS, TATIOT THAN ON MATCHAI TESOATEES, as meas figures (Black 1991: 20-1). Successful development should be measured not in abstract, aggregate growth indices, but according to other people-oriented criteria, such as the universal provision of basic needs, the promotion of social equity, the enhancement of human productive and creative capabilities, and the capacity of communities to set and meet their own development goals. New development approaches should be oriented toward the satisfaction of basic human needs and desires, particularly at the local community level; and development projects should 'build development around people rather than people around development' (ul Haq 1976: 27-8).





Redistributive and Basic-Needs Strategies

As dissatisfaction with the mainstream models became widespread within the development community during the early 1970s, many international and bilateral aid agencies began searching for alternative, more people-oriented approaches. Efforts were made to uncouple the direct, exclusive relationship between growth and development to make room in development programs for other considerations, such as distributional equity and poverty alleviation, basic-needs provisions, and the adoption of appropriate technologies. Programs promoting decentralized patterns of development were given





was accompanied by increased inequality' (Griffin 1989: 165).

The experience of the 1950s and 1960s suggested that, while growth was important, it was by no means a sufficient condition to induce broadly based development. In fact, growth could be impoverishing for a significant section of the population if it was paid for by a steady deterioration in the distribution of income and assets. In many countries, growth had been accompanied by declining standards of living and decreased access to productive resources for large numbers of people, including landless farmworkers, peasant cultivators, and many informal-sector workers. As



benefit to perhaps a third of their population.' In fact, ample evidence was available to contradict the notion that top-down development and trickle-down strategies, whether based on industrial or agricultural growth, would alleviate widespread impoverishment. Economic growth had simply failed to filter down – a fact that led many analysts to conclude that the nature, rather than the pace, of growth was the crucial factor for development. Mahbab ul Haq (1976: 24–5), a Pakistani economist and World Bank official, remarked:







prominence, and emphasis was shifted to projects which directly targeted the poor, especially in rural areas. Many organizations adopted a rather broad, eclectic, and loosely defined 'neopopulist' ideology (see Kitching 1982), in contrast to the well-structured, but narrow, theoretical base offered by neoclassical economics. The effect was to redefine the aims of development toward fostering fairer distributions of income and resources, encouraging local participation, and promoting small-scale projects employing socially and environmentally appropriate technologies. It was thought



ing socially and environmentally appropriate technologies. It was thought that by targeting the poor and adapting programs to suit local conditions and needs, growth and development would proceed in a dispersed manner 'from below' (Stöhr and Taylor 1981), rather than following the conventional top-down, concentrated pattern. Through encouraging 'self-help' and participatory decision-making, the latent energies and creativity of the poor could be directed toward rapid and more appropriate forms of development.





Some isolated, halting efforts had been made to initiate alternative development projects in a few Third World countries. Bernstein and Campbell (1985), for example, report that a 'populist movement,' which stressed local farming practices and indigenous forms of knowledge, gained some support within the British Colonial Office during the 1930s. Similarly, Moser (1989) traces the origins of the concept of 'community development' to the British, who used it to develop basic education and social welfare in some colonial areas. In the 1950s and 1960s, some small-farm development projects,





In his presidential address to the 1973 World Bank annual meeting, Robert McNamara expressed the view that the mainstream development strategies of the 1950s and 1960s had made an unacceptably small impact on Third World poverty and inequalities. Largely through the prodding of its Development Research Center under Hollis Chernery, the World Bank began to adopt a new development approach, termed 'redistribution with growth' (Chenery et al. 1974). Redistribution and growth were treated as complementary rather than contradictory elements of development



growth' (Chenery et al. 1974). Redistribution and growth were treated as complementary rather than contradictory elements of development; sustainable growth would require redistributive policies and targeted programs for the poor during the initial stages of development, instead of simply relying on trickle-down mechanisms to eventually spread the benefits of growth.





Although it contained these new emphases, redistribution with growth represented a modification rather than a clear break with previous mainstream development strategies. It retained much of the optimism of the earlier models in its promotion of the benefits of market-led growth. Redistribution of income toward the poor essentially remained tied to rapid economic growth; the traditional recipe of balanced growth was simply extended to cover social as well as economic development (Hettne 1000, 57). Although the poor formed





economic decision-making were largely avoided.

Parallel to the World Bank's strategy of redistribution with growth, the International Labor Organization (ILO) adopted a basic-needs approach during the 1970s. The idea of basic needs may have originated in a report by a group of Latin American theorists (Herrera et al. 1976), prepared for the Bariloche Foundation, Canada (see Preston 1986: 109). However, the basic-needs concept was formally placed on the international development agenda at a 1976 ILO World Employment Conference in which the participants adopted a 'Declaration of Principles and Program of Action for a Basic Needs Strategy of Development' (in ILO 1976: 189–214). As it was elabo-



 For example, minimum targets for food and housing requirements can be defined quantitatively with reference to daily intake of calories and square metres of dwelling space per person. Qualitatively they can be defined in terms of the proportion of protein in food intake and household facilities such as toilets, piped water, electricity and basic furniture



- Thus, the basic-needs approach enables targets to be stated as physical rations of specific goods and services, having universal validity, instead of the abstract monetary aggregates making up gross national product (GNP) estimates. It emphasizes the necessaries of life in place of the values of the market place. $\underline{3}$
- This volume examines the experience of a substantial number of the third world countries in implementing development plans during approximately the 1970's and draws some general conclusions for policy action during the years ahead.



• By the early 1970s, concern about environmental pollution led to a questioning of both the feasibility and the desirability of further growth of GNP in many developed countries, including the United States. This period also marked the realization that the problems of the poor in developed countries were far harder to solve through public welfare policy than had been believed earlier. These domestic concerns led to some change in the understanding of development issues as well. Many aid donors explicitly shifted the emphasis in aid policies to the problems of the poor.



• The concern about the distributional aspects of growth was reflected in appeals by the International Labour Office (ILO) and others to make the creation of productive employment opportunities, rather than aggregate income growth, a primary objective of policy. "A fundamental redirection of development strategy" was called for consisting of a rural strategy that "focuses on increasing the productivity of the small farmer and the self-employed through better access to land, water, credit, markets and other facilities"



- and an urban strategy of "[restructuring] the modern sector to make it more responsive to the opportunity cost of labor and capital ... [and] policies designed to reach the self-employed and to make small-scale producers more efficient" (8, pp. xvii-xviii). Subsequent emphasis in the World Bank on integrated rural development strategies and the choice of urban projects for Bank
- -8-



 The declaration of principles and program of action adopted by the Tripartite World Conference on Employment organized by the ILO proposed that strategies and national development plans and policies should include explicitly, as a priority objective, the promotion of employment and the satisfaction of basic needs of each country's population.



 It further specified that basic needs should be understood to include certain minimum requirements of a family for private consumption, such as adequate food, shelter, and clothing as well as certain household equipment and furniture, as well as certain essential services, such as safe drinking water, sanitation, public transport, and health, educational and cultural facilities (16).



 Kuznets, from his historical study of the development of some of the presently developed countries, hypothesized that income inequality first increases and then decreases as development proceeds. In testing this hypothesis, Ahluwalia related the share in income of various income classes to the logarithm of per capita GNP in constant 1970 U.S. dollars of 60 (developed and developing) countries, in the form of a quadratic regression. <u>4</u> The relationship was estimated separately for the entire sample and a sub-sample of 40 developing countries. His results showed that as per capita GNP rises, the share of income accruing to the poor -- say the bottom 40 percent of the population -- first falls, reaches a minimum, and then rises.

